



• T • E • M • P • E •  
**PRESERVATION**

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION  
COMMISSION**

Bob Gasser, Chair  
Richard Pagoria, Vice-Chair  
Mike Deskin  
Elias Esquer  
Ann Patterson  
Stuart Siefer, RA  
Liz Wilson

Alternate Member:  
Greg Bunce

♦ ♦ ♦

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION  
OFFICER**

Joseph G. Nucci, RA



The City of Tempe is a  
Certified Local Government,  
in association with the United  
States Department of the  
Interior/National Park Service



Tempe Historic  
Preservation Office  
Community Development  
Department  
21 East 6<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 208  
P.O. Box 5002  
Tempe, AZ 85280

♦ ♦ ♦

**480.350.8028**  
8579 FAX; 8913TDD



Tempe Historic Preservation Commission (Tempe HPC)

# MEETING MINUTES

Meeting Date: Thursday, January 12, 2006

Location: Hatton Hall

34 East Seventh Street

Commissioners Present:  
Greg Bunce  
Bob Gasser  
Rich Pagoria  
Ann Patterson  
Stu Siefer  
Liz Wilson (6:07)

Staff Present: Amy Douglass, Museum Administrator  
Joe Nucci, CDD Historic Preservation Officer

Public Present: Trevor Barger 85251  
Rev. Nathan Castle, o.p. 85282  
Narcissa Espinoza 85282  
Dan Killoren 85282  
Vic Linoff THMAB  
Pamela Rector 85283  
Ruperto M. Salinas 85281  
Richard J. Stumpf 85281

**Call to Order: 6:00 pm, Bob Gasser, Chair**

## I. Welcome and Introductions

Chairman Gasser acknowledged public in attendance, noted that Deputy Development Services Manager Mike Williams would not be here tonight, and indicated he would change the order of the agenda items to address the item of interest to the Newman Center proposal first. Newman Center representatives indicated they were waiting for another member to arrive and the order of the agenda need not be changed.

## II. Approval of Minutes

Chairman Gasser called for discussion of the minutes of the Tempe HPC meeting of [December 8, 2005](#). Hearing no discussion he then called for a motion to approve the minutes.

**MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER PAGORIA AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER SIEFER TO APPROVE MINUTES OF THE DECEMBER 8, 2005, TEMPE HPC MEETING. MOTION CARRIED 4-0 WITH COMMISSIONER WILSON ARRIVING AFTER THE VOTE AND ALTERNATE MEMBER BUNCE ALSO VOTING APPROVAL.**

### **III. Welcome New Member**

Chairman Gasser welcomed newly appointed alternate member Greg Bunce, stating the Commission is very pleased to have Greg on board.

### **IV. Discuss & Consider – International Existing Building Code**

Since DSD Manager Mike Williams could not attend the meeting, HPO Nucci presented a PowerPoint program providing an overview of the new code, explaining that the IEBC is an up-to-date code addressing repair, alteration, addition, or change of occupancy in existing and historic buildings and structures. He pointed out that many existing buildings and structures do not comply with the current building code requirements for new construction.

In essence, he said the new code provides some exceptions from earlier code requirements when the building in question has historic value.

### **V. Discuss & consider – Newman Center (Old St Mary's) Church**

Trevor Barger with the firm Espiritu Loci introduced a proposal for alterations to the All Saints Newman Center, which is on the site of the historic 1903 Old St. Mary's Church, a property listed in the Tempe Historic Property Register.

He said proposed alterations to the historic church are limited to the addition of an Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) complying ramp.

He said proposed new construction would remove the existing (c.1952) one-story assembly hall and construct a new two-story sanctuary and social hall. It is scheduled for review by the Tempe Redevelopment Review Commission and that review by the Tempe HPC is preliminary to that requirement. The applicant is also requesting a parking variance.

Mr. Barger explained the changes are designed in phases: Phase 1 will include construction of a new two-story sanctuary and social hall with solid infill panels in place of the glazing proposed for Phase 2. Phasing is suggested because the cost of glazing is beyond the center's current budget.

Chairman Gasser stated his concerns about the lack of visibility of the historic 1903 Old St. Mary's Church resulting from the recent construction of the ASU Foundation Building across the street on College Avenue. He and other commissioners indicated the proposed location of the new two-story sanctuary and social hall along University Drive will have a similar impact on the visibility of the church for eastbound traffic and pedestrians.

Ensuing discussion regarding the lack of glass in the sanctuary facing University Drive during Phase 1 and the length of time (at least 5 years) until glazing would occur under Phase 2. Also at issue were the right of way and a pitched roof above an arcade that obscures views of the old church.

Mr. Barger indicated it will cost several hundred thousand dollars to install glazing in the sanctuary now and the Newman Center cannot raise that amount of money right away. He said if the right-of-way is moved to the wall of the building, panels at the corners and

where egress occurs may have to remain as solid panels. He said that the design of the new structure attempts to recognize the look of the old church because the arcade reflects the shapes and forms of the fenestration in the historic church, as does the rhythm of the column spacing.

Mr. Gasser stated that the most effective way to maintain views of the historic church would be to locate new construction further north. Rev. Nathan Castle indicated a major design objective is to maximize the usable area of the interior courtyard for assemblies.

*MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER SIEFER AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER WILSON TO APPROVE SPR05192 ALL SAINTS CATHOLIC NEWMAN CENTER NEW CONSTRUCTION AT TEMPE HISTORIC PROPERTY OLD ST, MARY'S CHURCH AS DESIGNED AND INDICATED IN THE SUBMITTAL MARKED "PHASE TWO" FOR THE UNIVERSITY DRIVE ELEVATION. THE PROPOSAL MARKED "PHASE ONE" IS NOT APPROVED DUE TO ADVERSE EFFECTS ON THE VISIBILITY OF THE LANDMARK 1903 STRUCTURE. MOTION CARRIED 5-0 AND WITH ALTERNATE MEMBER BUNCE ALSO VOTING APPROVAL.*

*MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER PAGORIA AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER WILSON TO REQUEST THAT THE CITY NOT TAKE ADDITIONAL RIGHT-OF-WAY AT UNIVERSITY DRIVE. MOTION CARRIED 5-0 AND WITH ALTERNATE MEMBER BUNCE ALSO VOTING APPROVAL.*

**SUMMARY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTION FOR SPR05192  
(ALL SAINTS CATHOLIC NEWMAN CENTER 230 E UNIVERSITY DR DS051942)**

Chairman Gasser summarized an extensive discussion stating the primary concern of the Tempe Historic Preservation Commission is that the proposed design obscures visibility of the historic 1903 Old St. Mary's Church from both vehicular and pedestrian views.

*MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER SIEFER AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER WILSON TO APPROVE SPR05192 ALL SAINTS CATHOLIC NEWMAN CENTER NEW CONSTRUCTION AT TEMPE HISTORIC PROPERTY OLD ST, MARY'S CHURCH AS DESIGNED AND INDICATED IN THE SUBMITTAL MARKED "PHASE TWO" FOR THE UNIVERSITY DRIVE ELEVATION. THE PROPOSAL MARKED "PHASE ONE" IS NOT APPROVED DUE TO ADVERSE PROXIMITY EFFECTS ON THE VISIBILITY OF THE LANDMARK 1903 STRUCTURE. MOTION CARRIED 5-0 AND WITH ALTERNATE MEMBER BUNCE ALSO VOTING APPROVAL.*

*MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER PAGORIA AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER WILSON TO REQUEST THAT THE CITY NOT TAKE ADDITIONAL RIGHT-OF-WAY AT UNIVERSITY DRIVE. MOTION CARRIED 5-0 AND WITH ALTERNATE MEMBER BUNCE ALSO VOTING APPROVAL.*

**VI. Discuss & consider – Second-Tier Subdivisions (continued from 12/08/05)**

Chairman Gasser noted the subdivision tour of Date Palm Manor will begin at 9 a.m., at the east entrance at Mill Avenue. The objective of the tour will be to verify the overall historic integrity of the subdivision by preliminarily determining the frequency of contributing properties to an historic district.

**VII. Discuss & Consider – Flood Irrigation**

Chairman Gasser noted two proposed letters in the HPO Report provided as follow up with Water Utility Department incentives program. He indicated Commissioner Patterson also provided proposed text of a letter to property owners that was distributed at tonight's meeting. Discussion indicated the letter to homeowners is misleading in that it implies all Cultural Resource Area properties are eligible for historic designation. Commissioner Pagoria indicated this could be corrected by rewording the letter to more accurately reflect the range of conditions extant across CRA locations.

**VIII. Discuss & Consider – Historic Resources Poster**

Chairman Gasser noted the Cultural Resources Poster has been revised based on discussion at the Tempe HPC meeting on December 8, 2005. HPO Nucci displayed a draft image listing Endangered Cultural Resources as Valley National Bank (ASU Visitor Center), Eisendrath House, Hayden Flour Mill, and Gonzales-Martinez House. Also indicated as Saved Cultural Resources are Tempe National Bank Building, Farmer Goodwin House, Governor Howard Pyle House, and Tempe Beach Park Stadium.

*There was consensus to approve the 2006 Poster as submitted.*

### **IX. Discuss & Consider – Council Elections / Council Liaisons**

Chairman Gasser noted members should consider inviting council candidates to an upcoming Tempe HPC meeting.

*There was consensus for the Chair to send invitations to Council Candidates for the February 9, or March 9, 2006, meetings of the Tempe HPC, and to follow up with questions based on those previously developed.*

### **X. Discuss & Consider – Tempe Beautification Awards**

Chairman Gasser asked members to consider historic preservation project nominations and representatives for award program.

*There was consensus to nominate the Tempe National Bank Building for an award in the Historic Preservation category and to accept Commissioner Pagoria's offer to act as the HP Representative to the Beautification Awards Committee.*

### **XI. Optional Discussion: Items From Tempe HPO Report**

Chairman Gasser asked HPO Nucci to provide an update on the status of the Conservation Easement for the Farmer Goodwin House in the next HPO Report.

He asked HPO to provide an update on the status of the Tempe (Hayden) Butte Historic Context and National Register nomination in the next HPO Report and indicated he will assist in preparation of an RFP to complete this project.

Chairman Gasser noted that the Tempe Historic Preservation Foundation has been meeting with the Tempe Leadership Class of 2006 to produce a fundraiser on Saturday, April 29, 2006, at the Tempe Historical Museum courtyard. He asked that the Commission discuss participation and support of this important Foundation activity as an upcoming agenda item.

He noted that the agenda packet included a copy of Riggins Rules of conduct for volunteer boards and asked that members take the time to review them.

Chairman Gasser noted the Commission typically holds elections for Chair and Vice-chair in December. Since this was not done in 2005, he suggested postponing the election until after the March City Council election.

**Meeting adjourned at 7:58 PM.**

*Minutes scheduled for Tempe HPC adoption on 02/09/2006.*

---

**Bob Gasser, Chair**



HPCmins011206.doc filed City Clerk 02/10/06 Krosschell, Connie; Fillmore, Karen; Stennerson, Julie & posted to [www.tempe.gov/historicpres](http://www.tempe.gov/historicpres)

Draft issued for review comments to:	Review comments received from:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Trevor Barger 85251	<input type="checkbox"/>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rev. Nathan Castle, o.p. 85282	<input type="checkbox"/>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Ruperto M. Salinas 85281	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Richard J. Stumpf 85281	

Frequently Used Abbreviations or Acronyms:

**ABOR** – Arizona Board Of Regents: Arizona's state universities are under the jurisdiction and control of the Arizona Board of Regents. The state universities are operationally independent from each other, but, together with the Board, they comprise the principal components of the system of coordinated governance established by the Board and known as the Arizona University System.

**ADEQ** – Arizona Department of Environmental Quality: Established by the Arizona Legislature in 1986 in response to growing concerns about groundwater quality, ADEQ today administers a variety of programs to improve the health and welfare of our citizens and ensure the quality of Arizona's air, land and water resources meets healthful, regulatory standards.

**ADWR** – Arizona Department of Water Resources: Created in 1980 to ensure dependable long-term water supplies for Arizona's growing communities, the ADWR administers state water laws (except those related to water quality), explores methods of augmenting water supplies to meet future demands, and works to develop public policies that promote conservation and equitable distribution of water.

**APF** – Arizona Preservation Foundation: Arizona's only non-profit statewide historic preservation organization. Founded in 1979, APF is dedicated to preserving Arizona's historical, archaeological, architectural, and cultural resources.

**ASLA** – American Society of Landscape Architects: Founded in 1899, the ASLA is the national professional association representing landscape architects and promoting the landscape architecture profession and advancing the practice through advocacy, education, communication, and fellowship.

**CCDC** – Central City Development Committee: Formed in August 2004, when the Tempe City Council identified committees for the next two years. The entire council will serve on the Central City Development Committee of the Whole, which will address development at Town Lake, the Papago Park area and downtown.

**CDD** – City of Tempe Community Development Department: Established February 15, 2005, by City Manager Will Manley the CDD consists of six divisions; Economic Development, Housing Services, Redevelopment, Neighborhood Enhancement, Rio Salado/Town Lake, and Special Projects and is managed by Chris Salomone.

**CLG** – Certified Local Government: In 1980, Congress established a framework for local preservation programs through an amendment to the National Historic Preservation Act empowering Arizona cities and counties to become Certified Local Governments (CLGs). Once certified, these entities are eligible for specialized assistance and funds for developing their own local preservation programs. The City of Tempe became a CLG in 1995.

**DSD** – Development Services Department: Tempe Development Services Department is charged with the responsibility of enhancing the quality of Tempe's living environment, assuring the safety of buildings, enlarging the City's economic base and assisting low and moderate income households. The Tempe Historic Preservation Office is an agency of the Development Services Department.

**EPA** – Environmental Protection Agency: Authorized under Executive Order 11102 on December 4, 1970, the mission of the Environmental Protection Agency is to protect human health and the environment by working for a cleaner, healthier environment for the American people.

**FAIA** – Fellow of the American Institute of Architects: an honor awarded to members of the American Institute of Architects, members of the prestigious College of Fellows are recognized for having made significant contributions to the profession.

**HPAC** – Historic Preservation Advisory Committee: Arizona State Parks is governed by the State Parks Board and receives direction and oversight from several advisory committees and groups such as the Historic Preservation Advisory Committee, also known as HPAC.

**IEBC** – International Existing Building Code adopted by Tempe City Council by Ordinance No. 2005.89 on December 1, 2005, as part of the code body promulgated by the International Code Council, provides means for preservation of existing Tempe building inventory through reasonable and feasible code processes.

IRS – Issue Review Session: Mayor and Council public meeting where members of the public may come forward and talk with City Council during the “Call to the Audience” at the beginning of the IRS.

JRC – Joint Review Committee: Authorized under Resolution No. 2004.75 on 8/19/04, this seven-member board has four ASU positions and three City positions and is formed to review projects within the Mixed Use/Education zone.

PCBs – polychlorinated biphenyls: Toxic and persistent chemicals primarily used as insulating fluids in heavy-duty electrical equipment in power plants, industries, and large buildings across the country, most PCB applications were effectively eliminated by the Environmental Protection Agency on April 19, 1979, under final regulations banning their manufacture and phasing out most uses.

PSA – Papago Salado Association: Founded in 1992, the not-for-profit Association is a consortium of public agencies, local governments of Phoenix, Scottsdale and Tempe, and private organizations which have an interest in the area bounded by 44th Street, College Avenue, Oak Street, and University Drive. PSA promotes heritage education and is responsible for several projects to increase tourism and promote an identity for the area.

SHPO – State Historic Preservation Office: a division of Arizona State Parks, is responsible for the identification, evaluation, and protection of Arizona's prehistoric and historic cultural resources.

SRP-MIC – Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community: Created by Executive Order on June 14, 1879 by President Rutherford B. Hayes, the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community (SRPMIC) is located in Maricopa County, aside the boundaries of Mesa, Tempe, Scottsdale, Fountain Hills and metropolitan Phoenix.

Tempe HPC – Tempe Historic Preservation Commission: Created by Ordinance 95.35, adopted November 9, 1995. Members serve three year terms with the exception of the initial appointments. Meetings are held first Thursday of each month and are located at Hatton Hall, 34 E. 7th Street, Bldg. #B (public parking in Brickyard).

Tempe HPF – Tempe Historic Preservation Foundation: The Foundation is a private nonprofit corporation established in 2005, to advance the historic preservation objective of the Tempe Community at large.

Tempe HPO – Tempe Historic Preservation Office: Responsible for the identification and conservation of Tempe's prehistoric and historic cultural resources, the Office uses Federal, state, and city funding for the historic preservation program and assists owners of historic properties with grant applications, property maintenance, and preservation activities.

THM – Tempe Historical Museum: Located at 809 E. Southern Avenue in Tempe, the Tempe Historical Museum is a center where the community comes together to celebrate Tempe's past and ponder the future. Permanent and changing exhibits, educational programs, and research projects generally focus on some aspect of Tempe's history within the context of state and national events.

TOD – Tempe Transportation Overlay District (in production) The purpose of the TOD is to encourage appropriate land development and redevelopment consistent with and complementary to the community's focused investment in transit, bicycle, and pedestrian infrastructure in certain geographic areas of the City.

ZDC – Zoning & Development Code: Adopted by Mayor and Council on January 20, 2005, effective February 22, 2005, the ZDC implements Tempe General Plan 2030 by encouraging creative development of the built environment in order to build a community that promotes the livability and uniqueness of Tempe.